

**NEW
YORK
HISTORY**

SUMMER 2024

EDITORIAL BOARD

Robert Chiles, *Senior Lecturer, Department of History, University of Maryland*

Devin R. Lander, *New York State Historian*

Jennifer Lemak, *Chief Curator of History, New York State Museum*

Aaron Noble, *Senior Historian and Curator, New York State Museum*

UNDERGRADUATE INTERN

Brooke Timmins, *University of Maryland*

ADVISORY BOARD

Paula Baker, *Ohio State University*

Marsha E. Barrett, *University of Illinois,
Urbana-Champaign*

Thomas D. Beal, *SUNY Oneonta*

Patricia Bonomi, *New York University*

Jennifer Burns, *University at Albany*

Kelly Yacobucci Farquhar, *Montgomery County
Department of History and Archives*

Leslie E. Fishbein, *Rutgers University–New
Brunswick*

James D. Folts, *New York State Archives*

Michael Galban, *Ganondagan State Historic Site*

Timothy Gilfoyle, *Loyola University Chicago*

Susan Goodier, *SUNY Oneonta*

Georgette Grier-Key, *Eastville Community
Historical Society*

Kenneth T. Jackson, *Columbia University*

Lisa Keller, *Purchase College SUNY*

D.L. Noorlander, *SUNY Oneonta*

Timothy J. Shannon, *Gettysburg College*

Robert W. Snyder, *Rutgers University–Newark*

Ivan D. Steen, *University at Albany*

Thomas S. Wermuth, *Marist College*

The New York State Museum is a program of The University of the State of New York | The State Education Department | Office of Cultural Education

New York History (ISSN 0146-437x) is a peer reviewed journal published two times a year by Cornell University Press in partnership with The New York State Museum. Postage is paid at Ithaca, NY 14850 and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send all address changes to Cornell University Press, 512 East State Street, Ithaca NY 14850.

New York History is available in print and electronically Project Muse (<http://muse.jhu.edu>). Cornell University Press does not assume responsibility for statements of fact or opinions made by contributors. Unlicensed distribution of all materials (including figures, tables, and other content) is prohibited. Communications about subscriptions, back issues, reproductions and permissions, and other business matters should be sent to Cornell University Press (nyhjourn@cornell.edu). Digital and print subscriptions, for individuals and institutions, may be ordered via Project Muse (<https://www.press.jhu.edu/cart/for-sale?oc=3729>). Single print copies and print back issues are available for \$20.00 and check should be made out to Cornell University Press. For subscriptions and individual issues, inquiries and orders may be made by email, nyhjourn@cornell.edu, or by mail: *New York History* Journal, Cornell University Press, 512 East State Street, Ithaca NY 14850.

Submitted articles should address, in an original fashion, some aspect of New York State history. Articles that deal with the history of other areas or with general American history must have a direct bearing on New York State history. It is assumed that the article will have some new, previously unexploited material to offer or will present new insights or new interpretations. Editorial communications, including article submissions, should be sent to the Editorial Board via email (NYHJ@nysed.gov) Suggested length is 20-30 double spaced pages (or between 6,000 and 9,000 words), including footnotes. All submitted articles must include a 100-word abstract summarizing the article and providing keywords (no more quiseite permissions, and the payment of any fees associated with images for articles are all the responsibility of the author. *New York History* employs, with some modification, footnote forms suggested in the *Chicago Manual of Style*. More detailed submissions guidelines are to be found on the research and collections page of the New York State Museum: <http://www.nysm.nysed.gov/research-collections/state-history/resources/new-york-history-journal>

Cover art: *Front*: 2024 marks the 250th anniversary of the Shakers coming to colonial America. The Shakers were a small sect of Quakers that started in Manchester, England in 1747. They were formally known as the United Society of Believers in Christ's First and Second Appearing. Because of the zealous fervor associated with their ritual dance, they were known as the "Shaking Quakers" or "Shakers." After migrating to New York in 1774, the Shakers became a communal Christian religious society that flourished in the late 18th and 19th centuries. The first American Shaker settlement was in Niskayuna (later called Watervliet), Albany County, NY. *Back*: Shaker basket, seed box, chest of drawers, and fanning mill Collection New York State Museum



CONTENTS

Volume 105, Number 1

- v Letter from the Editors
- vii Contributors
- ARTICLES**
- 1 George P. Decker and the Defense of Six Nations' Treaty Rights During the Progressive Era
LAURENCE M. HAUPTMAN
- 31 James Spencer Whipple: New York State's "Indian Expert" and Progressive Era Conservationist
LAURENCE M. HAUPTMAN AND NÉHDŐWES (RANDY A. JOHN)
- 61 "A Woman's Measure": New York City Teachers, Politics, and the Fight for Equal Pay, 1897–1917
TARA M. MCCARTHY
- 78 Fernando Wood's Long Gilded Age
JEFFREY D. BROXMEYER
- 106 "L'Affare Cocchi": The Murder of Ruth Cruger and the Tragedy and Promise of World War I New York
CHRISTOPHER M. STERBA
- 132 Cruel Murder: A Story of Fear, Death, Childhood, and Enslavement in Early Nineteenth-Century Ulster County, New York
WENDY E. HARRIS
- 150 When Did New York Stop Speaking Dutch? The Persistence of the Dutch Language in Old New Netherland
KIERAN J. O'KEEFE
- FEATURES**
- 171 Artifact NY: Seeking Freedom in New York City
GABRIELLE MCCOY

- 175 **Artifact NY: Frost Town’s “Frozen Charlotte” Doll: Evidence of Family Life at a Logging Village in Ontario County, New York**
ALEXANDER J. SMITH AND EMILY YAHN
- 179 **Teach NY: W. E. B. Du Bois’s 1901 Study of Black Life in New York City**
ALAN J. SINGER
- BOOK REVIEWS**
- 194 **Bruce W. Dearstyne’s *The Spirit of New York: Defining Events in the Empire State’s History* (second edition)**
JAMES D. FOLTS
- 196 **Chris Elcock’s *Psychedelic New York: A History of LSD in the City***
DEVIN LANDER
- 198 **Denise Gigante’s *Book Madness: A Story of Book Collectors in America***
ERIC CIMINO
- 200 **Peter Charles Hoffer’s *Seward’s Law: Country Lawyering, Relational Rights, and Slavery***
ANDREW ARPEY
- 203 **Keith O’Brien’s *Paradise Falls: The True Story of an Environmental Catastrophe***
TERRY HAMBLIN
- 205 **A. Lynn Smith’s *Memory Wars: Settlers and Natives Remember Washington’s Sullivan Expedition of 1779***
JOE STAHLMAN
- 207 **Stephen J. Riegel’s *Finding Judge Crater: A Life and Phenomenal Disappearance in Jazz Age New York***
ERIN N. BUSH
- PUBLIC HISTORY REVIEW**
- 210 ***Henry Johnson: Ballad of a Forgotten Hero, Capital Repertory Theater***
AARON NOBLE

LETTER FROM THE EDITORS

Robert Chiles, Devin R. Lander, Jennifer Lemak, and Aaron Noble

One exciting branch of Empire State scholarship is critical explorations of the nature of community across New York history—offering granular details on the diverse factors that shaped New Yorkers’ lives and that draw attention to formerly obscure communities or add nuance and complexity to the stories of well-known groups and places. This issue of *New York History* features a wealth of such studies. In “When Did New York Stop Speaking Dutch?” Kieran J. O’Keefe assesses how colonial legacies, the Hudson Valley environment, migration, and religion powered the remarkable endurance of the Dutch language in New York. In this issue’s TeachNY feature, Alan J. Singer works with W. E. B. DuBois’s 1901 study of Black life in New York City in a pedagogy exploring how community events resonate both across history and into our own time. Our two ArtifactNY features also provide important insights into history at the community level: Gabrielle McCoy’s “Seeking Freedom in New York City” uses an 1837 letter about an escaped enslaved man from Maryland to investigate the precarious freedom of African American New Yorkers, while in “Frost Town’s ‘Frozen Charlotte’ Doll,” Alexander J. Smith and Emily Yahn discuss the 2022 discovery of a doll in a logging village in the Finger Lakes to reveal that children were “part of the social fabric” even in this remote industrial village—and that the

community was not isolated from the broader material culture of nineteenth-century America.

Several pairs of articles in this issue demonstrate how divergent perspectives on critical themes help complicate our understanding of community relations across New York’s past—whether exploring what responses to crimes tell us about historical communities, identifying the role of personal or professional motivations in constructing a political community, or elucidating the role of individuals’ values in shaping interactions between communities in conflict.

Two works centered on the Progressive Era reveal contradictory traditions in the state’s relationship with Indigenous peoples. In “The Contrarian,” Laurence M. Hauptman explores how attorney George Palmer Decker defended Indigenous treaty rights and challenged state policies at significant personal sacrifice, helping create the foundation for Indigenous peoples’ contemporary legal struggles; in “James Spencer Whipple: New York State’s ‘Indian Expert’ and Progressive Era Conservation,” Hauptman and Nêhdöwes demonstrate connections between Whipple’s celebrated role in conservation and his ethnocentric program to bring Hodinöhsö:ni’ under state control, analyzing how both programs sprung from the Cattaraugus County Republican’s interest in sustainability and scientific management, grounded in a racialized

definition of “progress.” A pair of articles on New York City politics explore cross-sections of policy and income. Tara M. McCarthy’s “A Woman’s Measure” argues for important connections between the fight for equal pay for women educators and the fight for women’s suffrage—detailing how these intertwined politics brought key activists into both battles. Jeffrey D. Broxmeyer’s article “Fernando Wood’s Long Gilded Age” contextualizes the Democratic mayor and congressman’s real estate speculation and demonstrates how factional politics provided Wood with lucrative commercial arrangements that helped finance enduring political prominence—opening space for Broxmeyer to reframe the “Gilded Age” as a concept in political history.

Two articles on contemporary responses to prominent homicides offer surprising opportunities to explore fresh perspectives on significant moments in New York history. Christopher M. Sterba’s “L’Affare Cocchi: The Murder of Ruth Cruger and the Tragedy and Promise of World War I New York” explores a 1917 “crime of the century” that featured a “blending of old and new impulses and strategies” that paralleled

the war effort itself—inspiring public fascination over gender, loyalty, and the power of the state, while provoking surprisingly little discussion about the ethnicity of the perpetrator. In “Cruel Murder: A Story of Fear, Death, Childhood, and Enslavement in Early Nineteenth-Century Ulster County, New York,” Wendy E. Harris scrutinizes an 1803 murder in Shawangunk, where an enslaved teenage girl murdered the six-year-old daughter of her enslavers, to reconstruct the lives of the enslaved and enslavers involved and contextualize the tragedy within the broader history of slavery in Ulster County.

As this issue goes to print, we are also preparing to mark the renaissance of another New York community, with the inaugural meeting of the New York History Conference in June in Albany. We are cheered by the proliferation of old and new in-person conferences in New York State and thrilled to be partners in building this community of historians.

Excelsior!

THE EDITORS

CONTRIBUTORS



JEFFREY D. BROXMEYER

Jeffrey D. Broxmeyer is associate professor in the Department of Political Science and Public Administration at The University of Toledo. His first book, *Electoral Capitalism: The Party System In New York's Gilded Age*, was published in 2020 by University of Pennsylvania Press. He is currently at work on a second book project that reexamines the spoils system across the 19th century in American politics.



WENDY E. HARRIS

An archaeologist and historic preservation consultant, Wendy E. Harris has been involved in numerous projects in the Hudson River Valley and New York City. She undertook some of this work as a graduate student at New York University's Department of Anthropology and eventually as a staff archaeologist for the New York District US Army Corps of Engineers. Her scholarship includes chapters contributed to *Environmental History of the Hudson River* (SUNY Press, 2011) and *Tales of Gotham, Historical Archaeology, Ethnohistory and Microhistory of New York City* (Springer, 2013). More recently, she was the co-author (with Arnold Pickman) of the award-winning documentary video *Where Slavery Died Hard: The Forgotten History of Ulster Co. and the Shawangunk Mountain Region*, produced by the Cragsmoor Historical Society. She presently serves on the Advisory Committee for Ulster County's Truth and Reconciliation Commission.



LAURENCE M. HAUPTMAN

Laurence M. Hauptman is SUNY Distinguished Professor Emeritus of History at SUNY New Paltz. He is the author, co-author, or co-editor of numerous articles and books in Native American history. Two of his books were published in the Spring of 2019: *Coming Full Circle: The Seneca Nation of Indians, 1848 to 1934*, from the University of Oklahoma Press; and *The Wisconsin Oneidas and the Episcopal Church: A Chain Linking Two Traditions* (co-edited with L. Gordon McLeister III, et al.), from Indiana University Press. On October 25, 2011, Dr. John B. King Jr., then New York State commissioner of education and later US Secretary of Education, awarded Hauptman the State Archives Lifetime Achievement Award for his research and publications on the Empire State.



**NĒHDÖWES
(RANDY A. JOHN)**

Nēhdōwes (Randy A. John) (doctorate of philosophy in social science, Syracuse University) is from the Allegany Territory and a member of the Seneca Nation's Turtle Clan. His academic journey began at Alfred State College (liberal arts), Syracuse University (psychology and sociology), and Yale University (sociology). He currently writes and publishes Seneca history and culture books via RAJ Publications and is a full-time hakso:d (grandfather).

Randy formerly held several positions for the Seneca Nation: director of the Seneca Nation Language Program, curator of the Seneca-Iroquois National Museum, assistant to the president of the Seneca Nation of Indians, and director of the Seneca Nation Area Office for the Aging, and is a retired sociology professor from St. Bonaventure University. He enjoys sharing his Onōndowa'ga:' (Seneca) research with the world. He resides on the Allegany Territory with his wife, Julie. Their children are Chelsea and Brendan, and Hudson is the grandson.



TARA M. MCCARTHY

Tara M. McCarthy is a professor of history at Central Michigan University with a primary focus on women's history. She received her PhD from the University of Rochester in 2005 and has been at CMU for sixteen years. She is the author of *Respectability and Reform: Irish American Women's Activism, 1880-1920* (Syracuse University Press, 2018), as well as articles on women's social and political activism in the Gilded Age and Progressive Era.



GABRIELLE MCCOY

Gabrielle McCoy is a third-year history PhD student at the University of South Carolina. Her dissertation analyzes how nineteenth-century white women used horseback riding to perform gender expectations and construct alternative definitions of womanhood. In addition to her dissertation, Gabrielle is actively working on a public history project that uncovers the identities and stories of enslaved people residing in Frederick, Maryland. Gabrielle has recently been published in the October 2023 edition of *Perspectives* on this topic.

**KIERAN J. O'KEEFE**

Kieran J. O'Keefe is an assistant professor at Lyon College in Batesville, Arkansas. He earned his PhD in history from The George Washington University in Washington, DC, in 2021. He is currently working on his book manuscript, titled *Suffering for the Crown: The Hudson Valley Loyalists, Violence, and Forced Migration in Revolutionary North America*.

**ALAN J. SINGER**

Alan J. Singer is a historian and teacher educator at Hofstra University in Hempstead, New York. His book *Social Studies for Secondary Schools* (fifth edition) was published by Routledge in May 2023, and *Class-Conscious Coal Miners* is scheduled for publication by SUNY PRESS in September 2024.

**ALEXANDER J. SMITH**

Alexander J. Smith is assistant professor of anthropology at SUNY Brockport. He is the director of Frost Town Archaeology, a collaboration with the Cumming Nature Center in South Bristol, New York. His research is focused on the history of logging and agriculture in the Finger Lakes region in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries following Euro-American colonial settlement. He received his PhD from Brown University's Joukowsky Institute for Archaeology and the Ancient World.



**CHRISTOPHER
M. STERBA**

Christopher M. Sterba teaches in the Humanities and Comparative World Literature Department at San Francisco State University. He is the author of *Good Americans: Italian and Jewish Immigrants during the First World War* (Oxford), and his articles have appeared in several publications, including *Western Historical Quarterly*, *Pacific Historical Review*, and the *Journal of American Ethnic History*. Sterba has recently completed a book manuscript, *Not a Lost Generation: The Great War Veterans Who Transformed American Popular Culture*, which is currently under review.



EMILY YAHN

Emily Yahn holds a BS in anthropology from SUNY Brockport and works with Frost Town Archaeology as a supervisor. Her research is concerned with the history of dolls with a particular emphasis on their use in nineteenth-century American culture. In 2023, she authored an exhibit on "Frozen Charlotte" ceramic dolls for the Cumming Nature Center in South Bristol, New York.